UOS Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities (UOSJSSH)
ISSN (P) 2224-2341, ISSN (E) 2310-0249
Volume: 8, (1) 2024, Pages (106-123)
Journal Homepage: https://uosjssh.su.edu.pk/

The Hereditary Party Politics of Benazir Bhutto and Political Development in Pakistan

Dr Riffat Mahmood

Higher Education Department, Punjab
Email: riffatmahmood393@gmail.com

Abstract:

Hereditary party politics has remained a norm in many developing states. The Political system of Pakistan has seen long military rules and military-backed-civilian governments. These traits have proved as a hurdle to inculcating democratic norms in the political setup of the state and the emergence of personalization traits in politics. After the first populist regime of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, powers shifted to Benazir Bhutto which gave birth to a hereditary trend in Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP). The period of Benazir Bhutto is considered the first hereditary party politics regime of the Pakistan Peoples' Party (PPP). The paper attempts to analyze the governance under the premiership of Benazir Bhutto to ensure political development in the state. The process of political development is examined through seven indicators including institutionalization, political participation, governance, legitimacy, accountability, distribution of power and national integration. The study concludes with the fact that the rule of Benazir Bhutto was the revival of democracy in Pakistan but was characterized by centralization of power, personality-oriented decision-making, nepotism, favouritism, lack of transparency and institutional clashes. Her political measures and strategies could not get desired results due to these mentioned hurdles and the process of political development in the state could not be ensured.

Keywords: *Hereditary Party politics, Political development, Nation-building, Institutionalization, Political Party.*

1. Introduction

Hereditary party politics has remained an important feature of developing polities and Pakistan is not the exception. Since its inception, the political system of Pakistan has been overshadowed by the influence of personalities. The personalized political system has given birth to a hereditary trend in the politics of the state. The personalized rule is defined by Rahat and Sheafer (2007) 'process in which the political weight of the individual actor in the political process increases over time, while the centrality of the political group declines' (p.65). While Brownlee (2007) added in the conditions of hereditary succession as 'a ruler's longevity in office and his fortune at having eligible offspring are the preconditions for comparing hereditary and non-hereditary successions. His study has concluded two main reasons for hereditary succession,

- The ruler's survival in the office to the point of preparing an orderly succession.
- The other reason includes the 'presence of viable adult heir' (p.597).

The case of Pakistan has revealed that the populist regime of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto has adopted authoritative traits within himself while ruling the state. The personalized trend in politics has

undermined the process of institutionalization in the state. Lodhi (2011) has depicted the undemocratic norms of the political system as 'the personalized nature of politics is closely related to the dominant position enjoyed throughout Pakistan's history by a narrowly based political elite that was feudal and tribal in origin and has remained so in outlook even as it gradually came to share power with well to do urban groups' (p.81-82).

The personalized rule of Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto has left the organizational structure of PPP weak and ignored which resulted in the unavailability of alternate party leadership except him. This was the time when hereditary trends emerged in the party leadership of the PPP.

The concerned qualitative study with historical, descriptive and exploratory research designs attempts to analyze how the hereditary party politics of Benazir Bhutto has contributed to the process of political development in the state. The primary and secondary data collection sources are employed. The process of political development will be explored based on the following selected indicators of political development.

1. Institutionalization
2. Governance
3. Political Participation
4. National Integration
5. Legitimacy
6. Accountability
7. Distribution of Power

2. Period of Benazir Bhutto (1988-1990, 1993- 1996)

Benazir Bhutto has assumed the charge of PPP as its chairman in a very acute situation. To retain the political legacy of Bhutto, Benazir Bhutto his daughter has opted to return to Pakistan and lead the party. Benazir Bhutto's arrival in Pakistan on the 10th of April 1986 during Zia's government was a clear indication of succession politics and declaration of being the only successor of Bhutto's political legacy. Although the story of her succession was not smooth but she was not the sole uncontested successor of Bhutto's legacy, but her brother Murtaza Bhutto had also claimed as the competent and eligible candidate for succession. The family tussle keeps going silently and get worse during the second tenure of Benazir Bhutto as the Prime Minister of State. The efforts were made by her brother to mobilize a few like-minded groups in PPP to get support for his claim of succession. The situation changed with the murder of Murtaza Bhutto in 1996 during the rule of Benazir Bhutto. The sad incident has put a question mark on the credibility of Benazir Bhutto as well as on the legitimacy of her rule.

Benazir Bhutto took over the party headship during the authoritative rule of Zia-ul-Haq. The military rule of Zia-ul-Haq has imposed restrictions on political activities after staging a coup and toppling the government of Bhutto. This period was tough for the political parties and political leadership. Benazir Bhutto tried to unite the party and keep her struggle continuing for the restoration of democracy. She tried to build pressure on the government being herself in exile. Her efforts have kept the name of the PPP alive in the political activities of the state. The death of Zia-ul-Haq in 1988 provided opportunities for political activities to flourish in the state. The concerned political scenario has made a feasible condition for PPP to get a prominent position in the election. After coming to power, the government of PPP under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto has contributed the following steps toward the process of political development.

3. Institutionalization

The concept and theory of institutionalization have provided a base and focus to study political development. Huntington (1968) has equated political development, order, and stability to institutionalization. He defined institutionalization as it is the 'process by which organizations and procedures acquire value and stability'. 'The level of institutionalization of any political system can be defined by the adaptability, complexity, autonomy and coherence of its organizations and procedures' (p.12).

Ben-Dor (1975) has added, the main theory by Huntington is based on the notion that the 'key to political development lies in improving the capacity to build effective (as well as valued, and thus legitimate) political institutions' (p.324) while the political systems with fragile institutionalization can facilitate the politics of personalization. Huntington (1968) believes that 'societies with weak political institutions lack the ability to curb the excesses of personal and parochial desires' (p.24). The services of Benazir Bhutto, toward institutionalization to ensure political development have remained as follows.

3.1.Parliamentary Legislation

The victory of the PPP in the elections 1988 revived the parliamentary democracy in the state. PPP had secured 93 seats in the National Assembly and formulated the coalitional government. The lack of a simple majority has awarded the power to PPP to formulate a government under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto but with tied hands. The weak coalitional government could not initiate any fundamental changes through legislation. The government of PPP remained unable to pass basic legislation and faced problems in getting assembly approval for their budget. The government had to face the following major hurdles in legislation.

a) The coalitional government had to take into concern the interest and desires of coalition partners.
b) The government of the PPP had to accept Ghulam Ishaq Khan as their presidential candidate (with immense powers of the 8th constitutional amendment).
c) In the absence of basic legislation, the government had to rely on ordinances to run the system. The dependence on ordinances shows the weakness of the government as these ordinances were not relevant to only administrative, legal, or financial matters but political matters and the matters that pertain to terrorism was also addressed through the same practice of issuing ordinances.

The lack of majority support in parliament has created a challenging situation for the PPP's government to legislate. Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto had faced the threat of a no-confidence move twice in her first tenure in office. During the first attempt of no-confidence, the motion was failed with the only difference of twelve votes. Benazir Bhutto has received 148 votes in favour (The New York Times).

Overall, the performance of the legislature went on weak lines during the stay of Benazir Bhutto as the Prime Minister of state. Wynbrandt (2009) has added that the first tenure of Benazir Bhutto was without any piece of legislation except two annual budgets (p.230).

The second tenure of Benazir Bhutto has started as a result of an election in 1993. PPP managed to secure 86 seats and a coalitional government was formulated. The performance of the government was like the previous tenure of PPP. No significant fundamental change was introduced through legislation. However some positive administrative steps were introduced to promote good governance in the state.

3.2. Civil-Military Relations

The rule of Benazir Bhutto and the circumstances which leads her to be the head of the government were characterized by the features of mutual insecurities, lack of trust and clashes between the government and the military.

Following events widened the gap between the military and civilian government.

- Benazir Bhutto has appointed a committee to monitor and review the role of intelligence agencies in a democratic setup. (Shafqat, 1996, p.661). The involvement of the civilian government has conveyed the expression of a trust deficit which ultimately affects civil-military relations.
- The civil-military rift touched the intense level over the issue of the authority of appointment of chief of services and joint chief of staff committee. The concerning issue has not only given birth to the tense relationship of civilian government with the military but with the President as well. The basis of this constitutional crisis or confusion was the executive order of Z.A Bhutto, which was not clear about the term of the joint chief of staff committee. Benazir Bhutto was of the view that Prime Minister has the power to retire the military (JCSC). While on the other hand, the President by quoting Article 243 (C) was claiming his authority to appoint JCSC and services chiefs (Shafqat, 1996). The concerned scenario depicts the lack of understanding on the part of governing authority about the organizational structure of the military and the constitution.
- The Pucca Qila incident has created intensity in existing differences between the civilian government of Benazir Bhutto and the military. It was an ethnic conflict between the Sindhi community and the Muhajir community that resulted in casualties. It was the incident that depicts the lack of working relationships and communication between the police and military. The basis of the clash between the military and the Benazir government was the timings and conduct of the operation.
- The situation reaches the point of no return when Benazir Bhutto has tried to intervene and influence unnecessarily the matters of the army's selection board. The selection board of the army is held once a year to decide about promotions, retirement, and postings of higher ranks. Benazir Bhutto has tried to influence the recommendations of the selection board and suggested extending the period of Alam Jan Mehsud (Lieutenant General, posted as corps commander Lahore).

The constant involvement of civilian government in the professional domain of the military has widened the rift between both institutions. The tense relationship between the above two institutions has resulted in the removal of the civilian government. The government of PPP under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto has not tried to uplift the capacity and credibility of political institutions while the whole tenure was the reflection of constant clashes and differences over the jurisdiction of power and authority. Such an environment has never proved a feasible one for political development.

While her second term (1993-96) in office as a Prime Minister was much more mature and peaceful in keeping relations with other state institutions. The civilian government has kept itself aside in the internal organizational domain of the military as well as all issues relevant to the appointment of services chiefs were handled smoothly with mutual trust and tolerance. The approach of tolerance, institutional harmony and respect for jurisdiction was a positive sign towards political development in the state.

4. Governance Dynamics

Madon (2009) has added that 'good governance is one of the key requirements for the achievement of democratic development' (p.33). There prevails a close link between governance and development. Islam (2017) stated 'the concept of governance is concerned directly with the management of the development process, involving both the public and private sectors' (p.39). Good governance is essential to carry out and ensure the process of development. Good governance usually fosters democratic governance which ultimately strengthens the institutions.

The role of political parties is vital to highlight public demands and formulate concrete policies to fulfill those demands after getting power. PPP which emerged as a populist party turned into a hereditary party after Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The following section will analyze the policies of PPP under Benazir Bhutto in the domain of governance dynamics that contribute to the process of political development.

4.1. Introduction of Reforms in the Agriculture Sector

The government of PPP under Benazir Bhutto has tried to follow the revolutionary policies of land reforms implemented by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. The rule of Benazir Bhutto has not introduced major changes in land reforms. The initiatives taken by the government regarding land reforms are the continuation of land reforms introduced in 1977 by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. To boost agrarian production the following steps have been taken by Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto.

- Many managerial changes have been introduced at Pakistan Agricultural Research Council (PARC) to promote specialization, research, and increase agricultural output.
- The Farming Systems Research (FSR) was focused to increase production and resolve the issues of farmers.
- The Operational Research Programme (ORP) was introduced to implement modern technology to increase per-unit and per-acre resource optimization.
- A systematic coordination program was devised within inter/ Intra related institutions to promote professional scientific cooperation to boost the national research system. Infrastructure development and institutional development was focused to develop a comprehensive agriculture policy.
- Total expenditures on agriculture and livestock were reported at 742 million in 1988-89 (Mellor Associates, 1994).
- The agriculture growth from 1988-89 to 1993-94 has to remain 3.6 percent. (World Bank, 1994).
- PPP administration has distributed 35000-acre land among farmers.

Above mentioned initiatives were good steps toward bringing economic prosperity. But these steps were charged with the politics of patronage.

4.2. Steps to Preserve Human Rights& Women's Empowerment

Being the first female Prime Minister in the history of the Muslim world, the government of PPP has worked to highlight women's empowerment. The administration of PPP has tried to replace Zia's conservative image of society and especially the status of women. PPP has adopted the following measures to preserve human rights in society and tried to highlight the importance of women's empowerment.

- After assuming the charge of Premiership, Benazir Bhutto released many female prisoners from jails. Those were all from a very poor class. It was a symbolic gesture to convey that the leaders feel the pain of the masses.
- The PPP government has revived the role of trade unions and women were also given opportunities in this regard.
- The press and media censorship of the Zia-ul-Haq era was replaced with little liberalization resulting in a portrayal of women in media.
- Women were awarded political positions during the Benazir period. Weiss (1990) stated, 'no women were given ministerial portfolios, although this was reversed on March 23, 1989, when Benazir expanded the federal cabinet to 43 members, including five women' (p.437).
- The seventh five-year plan (1988-93) also acknowledged the neglected status of women in society regarding health, education, and financial status (Planning Commission, p.281). But unfortunately it remained unable to explain the enforcement strategy of the administration to achieve the concerned target. The PPP administration has tried to work in this regard by establishing a 'Ministry of Women's Development.'
- Ministry of Women Development was entitled to create employment opportunities for women, initiate training programs to improve skills in the female segment of society as well as increase the political participation of women.
- The Ministry of Women's Development has issued a journal titled, Solidarity; SAARC Women Journal, to highlight the seriousness of PPP's administration to uplift the status of women in society.
- Many forums were created under the supervision of the Ministry of Women's Development, the Women's Jail Committee, the Women's Legal Right Committee and a Women's Legal Aid Committee.
- The PPP administration has allocated 100 million rupees to establish a women's bank. This effort was the recognition of the government's vision to accept women as independent economic entities (Dawn, 1989).

Benazir Bhutto has received the 'United Nations Human Rights Award' for her services as a Prime minister regarding women's rights, children's rights and minority rights. The services of Benazir Bhutto for women's uplift have remained well to boost the morale of a weak segment of society. It can be regarded as a positive contribution toward political development. Political development can never be ensured in the presence of gender inequality in terms of the provision of opportunities.

4.3. Introduction of Labour Reforms

The administration of PPP under Benazir Bhutto has aimed to follow the labour policy of his father Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto. Prime Minister Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto introduced a progressive labour policy in 1972, which includes an increase in the wages of labour, an increase in production, the formation and revival of trade unions to protect the rights of labour, the right to get written appointment or termination, formation of labour courts and formation of National Industrial Relation Commission (NIRC) (Ghayur, 2009, p.13). The era of Benazir revived the working of trade unions, labour wages were increased and aimed to provide residence to the labour class by establishing labour colonies.

4.4. Provision of Basic Human Needs

The rule of PPP under the leadership of Benazir Bhutto has set in its priorities to focus on the provision of basic human needs. The PPP has shifted its ideological foundations by shifting from socialist goals to the policy of privatization (The Nation, 1989). The intention was good, but the government remained unable to formulate a coherent economic policy. Shafqat (1996) added that 'unemployment, inflation, and stagnation in the industrial enterprises particularly in the public sector, demanded immediate policy action which the Bhutto government did not seem able to provide' (p.665).

The government of Benazir Bhutto was motivated to bring reforms in the educational sector of Pakistan. For the said purpose, the administration of Benazir Bhutto has worked to improve the literacy rate in the state as follows:

- Benazir Bhutto has signed the 'Education for All' (EFA) policy proposal in Thailand. This policy framework was signed by 155 countries in 1990. But the initiative remained on paper only as the government of PPP was dismissed before completing its constitutional tenure (Asia Report No. 84, 2004).
- The budget allocation on education was increased. As in 1995, education expenditure was recorded as 2.8 of the GDP, which increased to 3.0 in 1996 (Haq, 1998). According to the Education Policy of Pakistan, the spending of the education budget for primary education was 45 % in 1988-93, while for secondary education it was recorded at 28 %, and teacher's training account for 1.3 percent of the total education budget.
- During 1993-98 the figures remained at 47 %, 24% and 4.9% respectively (Malik, 2012). It is also reported that the training of teachers has remained a neglected area. Although it is an important point to focus on to uplift the standard of education in the state.

Overall, the adopted policies of Benazir's rule seem essential for the provision of basic needs, but the implementation of policies reported some weaknesses. The government of the PPP has indulged itself in the politics of patronage instead of formulating a coherent economic policy and ensuring good governance. The politics of favoritism and selective provision of opportunities can never contribute positively to the process of political development

4.5. Freedom of Expression

The rule of the PPP under Benazir Bhutto has turned into the revival of democracy after a long military dictatorship. The term of Benazir Bhutto has been marked by the efforts to bring true democratic norms to Pakistan. The media in the state denotes the freedom of expression as well as conveys popular opinion on governmental performance. Media is a channel of communication between the government and the masses. The military rulers have always tried to hijack the said channel to prolong their stay at the helm of affairs.

The media (print media and electronic media) in Pakistan has faced severe restrictions and censorship during the military rule of General Zia-ul-Haq. The civilian rule of Benazir Bhutto has marked a ray of hope in this regard. Niazi (2002) stated that the initial days of Benazir Bhutto's government in 1989 had observed 'another short period of relaxation in control over the electronic media. It proved to be short-lived: Benazir reverted to despotic control over the state-owned Media which in turn, reverted to their time-honoured role of toeing the government line' (p.187).

There were times when Benazir Bhutto was observed complaining about the biased role of the media. When her government was dismissed in 1990, she accused the media in a press conference, of supporting the establishment instead of a civilian democratic government.

Overall, the relations of the PPP (under Benazir Bhutto) with the media were like keep on changing with the circumstances. The role of media is essential to create awareness among the masses and keep an eye on the performance of the government. But the Rule of Benazir Bhutto seemed quite weak to formulate a coherent media policy. The media can bring national integration and unity through its positive role in the state, which is a prerequisite of political development.

4.6. Innovation in Communication

The era of Benazir Bhutto has been marked by efforts to promote technological advancement in the domain of communication. The era of the 1990s was a period of global change, privatization, and technological innovation in data and communication. The government of Pakistan also worked to build telecommunication infrastructure in the state. Pakistan telecommunication act was approved in 1996, which is considered a milestone in communication advancement. Under this act following steps were taken by the PPP's government.

- Pakistan Telecommunication Company Ltd. (PTCL) was created in 1996. It offered national and international telecommunication services to the state.
- The National Telecommunication Corporation (NTC) was established to provide telecommunication services to the federal government, provincial governments, and armed forces.
- Pakistan Telecommunication Authority (PTA) was established to regulate telecommunication services in the state. It aims to provide better connectivity, modernize services, and investigate citizen complaints as well as licensing services.
- Internet services were also started during the rule of Benazir Bhutto. Initially, sixteen companies were licensed to provide email and internet services in 1996.
- The optic fiber was installed near the river Indus right bank.
- Cellular phone technology, FM radio, and Satellite dishes were promoted during the era.

The government of Benazir Bhutto has performed well in providing communication advancement in the state. Communication modernization is a sign of an open society. Advancement in communication has a strong link with good governance as it helps the government to perform better and ultimately contributes positively toward political development.

5. Political Participation

Popular participation in the political process is essential to ensure good governance in the state. Ibrahim (2014) added ‘Political participation provides equal rights to participate in all spheres of the political activities without gender discrimination’ (p.189). Political participation is not limited to electoral procedure only but includes freedom of expression, liberty to assemble, participation in public affairs and holding of public offices.

The role of a political party is essential at every step of political participation as well as to ensure participatory democratic government. Almond (1963) believed that participatory democratic government is one of the popular notions of political development (p.32).

Due to long military rules in Pakistan, opportunities were very limited for the public to participate in the political process of the state. PPP has emerged as a populist party that put efforts to mobilize the public for their basic human rights. The hereditary rule of Benazir Bhutto has contributed following to ensure popular participation in the state.

5.1. Introduction of Electoral Reforms

The government of Benazir Bhutto has introduced some electoral reforms with special reference to northern areas of Pakistan. The Northern Area Council was established to govern the matters of northern areas. A legal framework order was issued in 1994 by the PPP's government, which converted the Northern Area Council to the Northern Areas Legislative Council. The act was a first step toward awarding autonomy to the said council toward local affairs. Initially, these matters were governed by the federal government. According to the Northern Areas Legal Framework Order, 49 subjects of local governance matters were awarded to the council. It was a good step of Benazir's rule toward awarding autonomy to ignored areas, but major practical developments were observed in the period of Dictator General Musharraf.

Another important step to ensure mass mobilization was the inclusion of the public in MRD as it was an opportunity to create awareness among the masses against the authoritative rule. PPP was leading the alliance of MRD. Rais (1989) stated that 'MRD was effective in mobilizing masses in certain parts of the country, but it failed to force the Zia regime to restore democracy (p.202).

The government of Benazir Bhutto had tried to follow the footsteps of her father to mobilize the public but the authoritative traits adopted by the Benazir could not maintain the relationship of the party at the grass-root level.

6. National Integration

National integration is a necessary condition for economic and political development (Shakir, 1982, p.36). National integration means the creation of unity and acceptance of religious, ethnic, lingual, or regional diversities. The important link between political development and national integration can be observed through the addition of Mannir uz zaman (1967), who believes, new nations face challenges of political development based on national integration in two terms i.e., the resolution of regional cleavages as well as the creation of an over-arching set of political values (p.877).

Being a newly born state, Pakistan has faced challenges of political development owing to a weak political structure and long military rules. The government of PPP under Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto had performed well to create unity and boost the morale of the nation after the incident of separation of East Pakistan. The government of PPP under Benazir Bhutto had also tried to follow the same enthusiasm and struggled hard to revive the democratic system in the state. The party politics of Benazir Bhutto have depicted the following contributions toward national integration which is one of the basic aspects of political development.

6.1. The Government-Opposition Relations

The civilian popular government of Benazir Bhutto was a ray of hope for true democracy after a long military rule. PPP turned into a majority party in elections in 1988 and 1993 but lacks majority seats to formulate a government. In both terms, Benazir Bhutto has formulated a coalitional government. Initially, the government has adopted the way of cooperation and intends to work professionally with the opposition. The alliance of opposition has given a tough time to the government.

The second tenure of Benazir Bhutto has adopted a different approach to keep relations with the opposition when avoiding adversities with the opposition could not come up fruitful. The main opposition party in the second term of Benazir Bhutto was PMLN and MQM at the provincial level in Sindh. The said period of PPP was a pure example of constant clashes between PPP and PMLN. Instead of promoting democratic norms in politics, she unintentionally tried to be all in

all. The mindset of concentration of power gave birth to internal party rifts as well. She had to cope with not only opposition parties but opposition within her party. The ongoing family tussle has worsened the situation of the party as well. Murtaza Bhutto, her brother has claimed to be the heir of Bhutto's political legacy that was also supported by Nusrat Bhutto. Benazir Bhutto had tried to suppress the family clashes. After the brutal murder of Murtaza Bhutto, 'Nusrat Bhutto declared that the Benazir government was worse than Zia-ul-Haq's, while the government claimed there were RAW (Indian Intelligence Agency) agents among Murtaza's followers who provoked the incident' (Amin, 1994, p.141).

The constant tussle between the government and the opposition has resulted in confrontational politics. Amin stated, 'an intense political confrontation between the PPP government led by Benazir Bhutto and the opposition Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz led by Nawaz Sharif dominated Pakistani politics in 1994' (p.140).

A truly democratic government should adopt the principle of cooperation instead of confrontation. Constructive criticism of opposition always guides the government toward better. There is a need to create harmonious relations between the government and the opposition to contribute positively to the process of political development. Unfortunately, in this regard, the era of Benazir Bhutto's rule is a combination of constant tussle, clash, and confrontation with the opposition.

6.2. Centre-Province Relationship

The creation and maintenance of centre-province harmony is an essential feature of a healthy federal system. The constitution of 1973 has devised a federal form of government in the state. During both official terms of the PPP, a split mandate was observed in parliament. PPP has formulated coalitional governments by allying with other parties. The first elected period of the PPP in 1988 has experienced many electoral alliances. The prominent alliance was IJI, which was formed to counter PPP.

During the stay of the PPP in power, the centre-province relationship has been observed stained and disturbed. PPP had emerged as a prominent party at the provincial level in Sindh. The national-level prominent parties could not perform well at the provincial level except Sindh. While regional leadership has performed well in the form of independent candidates. In provincial assemblies of NWFP (present Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) and Baluchistan, PPP had secured 9 and 1 seat respectively (Gallup Pakistan). IJI was limited to the province of Punjab with the Chief Minister of Nawaz Sharif. The situation of the Punjab government and the federal government of PPP remained tough and both governments had blamed each other for rigging in elections. The centre-province relationship was having the following specific issues.

A strong rift was observed between the government of Punjab (IJI) and the federal government of PPP. Both were claiming a lack of transparency in the election process. Benazir Bhutto addressed a press conference on 3rd December 1988 and stated, 'there had been our government in Punjab also if the election were held without rigging; a group is making intrigues against PPP' (Dawn, December 4, 1988).

The Baluchistan Assembly was dissolved by the governor on December 15, 1988. This step of the provincial government was backed by the federal government, it was opted to warn and control the Punjab Assembly. However, the Baluchistan Assembly was restored through an order of the Baluchistan High Court on January 23, 1989.

The Council of Common Interest (CCI) is a constitutional institution that was formed under articles 153 and 154 to resolve matters between the federal government and the provincial

government. The federal government of PPP was hesitant to call the meeting of CCI during the ongoing tussle between the Punjab government and the federal government (Younas, 1993, p.237). Although to resolve the economic matters, the Punjab government was insisting to call the session of CCI (Abdullah, 1990). The Punjab government was demanding to call the session to discuss the royalty of natural gas, the distribution of electricity as well as the construction of the Kala Bagh Dam. However, a deadlock was observed between both governments and no practical solution was formulated to end the constant tussle. On another occasion, the federal government refused to provide railway wagons to the ittefaq industry (owned by the Sharif family). The tussle of power also depicted some personal conflicts and grudges.

Confrontational politics have deteriorated the chances of public welfare. The torturing relationship between both governments and the misuse of power regarding constitutional bodies paved the way for President Ghulam Ishaq Khan to dissolve assemblies on August 6, 1990.

The undemocratic behaviour of the PPP contributes negatively to the process of national integration and watered the ethnic feelings in the state. The second tenure of Benazir Bhutto was mature enough as compared to the first rule as she tried to focus on governance issues more. Despite her efforts, the deteriorating economy, corruption, nepotism and law and order crisis paved the way to dissolve the government by the President under 58 (2) (b) on November 5, 1996.

6.3. Civil Disturbance

The government of PPP has experienced some incidents of civil disturbances. Such as

- A religious revolt erupted between two groups in Malakand Division in NWFP (present Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). It was aimed to implement the law of Islamic Sharia in the state by Tehreek-e-Nifaaz Shariat Muhammadi (TNSM). The revolt turned violent and caused eleven deaths. The response of the ruling government of Benazir Bhutto was late enough that includes the use of power and resulted in bloodshed when TSNM activists block roads in the districts of Dir, Malakand and Swat. Some government officials and civil court judges were hosted by TSNM activists to build pressure on the government to accept their demands.
- In Sindh, the clashes between MQM and PPP were observed on the issue of power-sharing strategy. It turned out as an ethnic and sectarian clash of Shia and Sunni sects that resulted in casualties. The support of the military was asked to keep the situation in Karachi under control and peaceful.

These incidents have put a question mark on the capability and credibility of the governmental structure. The institutional clashes have deteriorated the governmental response to meet the challenges timely with full responsibility. The 'political conflicts in Pakistan are predominantly ethnic in nature, followed by sectarian hostility' (p.726). Major ethnic movements faced by Pakistan include Pashtoon and Baloch nationalism in NWFP (present Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa) and Baluchistan, Muhajir Movement in Sindh and sectarian movement of Shia-Sunni strife and anti-Ahmadi agitation concentrated in Punjab. The mentioned issues have caused national integration challenges for the state. These clashes and movements have served as test cases to judge the capacity of governmental setups.

Overall the tenure of Benazir Bhutto was characterized with the situation as 'the political system suffered from institutional decay, widespread financial corruption and spiraling ethnic, sectarian and religious violence, leading to near-anarchic conditions in certain parts of the country'(Amin, 1994, p.140).

7. Legitimacy

The smooth working of any democratic system is depending upon the capacity of a political setup to exercise coercive authority and expansion of political legitimacy. Legitimacy can be described as the popular recognition of political setup. The popular acceptance awards the government, the legal authority to formulate policies and their enforcement in the state. Lipset (1960) stated legitimacy is the ability of a political system to make sure that the existing institutional structure is best suited for the society. It is also believed that legitimacy is an efficient way to secure obedience and is conducive to stability (p.64).

The concept of legitimacy is observed in two aspects. Scharpf (1997) has stated that legitimacy is a two-dimensional concept, that contains the input and output functions of a political system. The input function involves the mechanism and procedure that link political decisions with popular demands by ensuring the accountability of government. In the present world, the mechanism is reflected in terms of representative institutions. Scharpf believes that democracy turns into an 'empty ritual' if democratic values are not generating effective outcomes. While the outcome function of legitimacy is all about the systematic performance of a system that must be aligned with the common demands of citizens (p.19). Weber (2002) has added to the literature on legitimacy by categorizing the concept into rational-legal legitimacy and charismatic legitimacy (p.124).

The concept of legitimacy is interlinked with the capacity of a political system that ultimately leads and determines the process of political development in the state.

The rule of Benazir Bhutto in terms of legitimacy can be observed on the grounds of voter turnout, law and order, institutional collaboration, and financial transparency.

7.1. Voter turnout

The election of 1988 brought Benazir Bhutto into power. It was the revival of the democratic set-up in Pakistan after the long military rule of General Zia-ul-Haq. The voter turnout remained at 42.8% whereas PPP had secured in its favour the percentage of 37.6% votes. PPP had successfully secured 94 seats while its contesting candidates were around 183. The table below shows the PPP's standing in the election 1988.

PPP's Position in Election 1988

PPP's Position in Polls	Election Statistics
Total voter turnout	42.8%
PPP's Votes	7,488,934
PPP's Voter turnout	37.6%
PPP's Contesting candidates	183
PPP's Secured Seats	94

Source: Assembly, P. C. N. (1988). Historical Archive of Parliamentary Election Results Islamabad, Pakistan: Inter-Parliamentary Union.

After the election of 1988, PPP has got an opportunity to formulate its government again in 1993. Instead of improving its electoral position, PPP has lost its eight seats as compared to the election in 1988. The table below indicates the PPP's position in the election of 1993.

PPP's Position in Election 1993

PPP's Position in Polls	Election Statistics
Total voter turnout	41 %
PPP's Votes	7578635

PPP's Voter turnout	37.8%
PPP's Secured Seats	86

Source: Pakistan, E. C. O. (1994). Report on General Elections 1993 (Vol. I, pp. 238-239.). Islamabad: ECP.

PPP has emerged as a populist party after long military rule. The elections of 1988 were conducted under the constitution of 1973 with the inclusion of the eighth amendment. The regime of Benazir Bhutto has appeared as a constitutional popular regime. The concept of democracy was a ray of hope after a long history of authoritarian rule.

7.2. State of Law and Order

Both terms of Benazir Bhutto faced serious challenges of law and order. Major challenges include the sectarian conflicts in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. In Sindh, the economic hub of Pakistan 'Karachi' has suffered a series of violence. The sectarian and ethnic clashes emerged in 1992 when a clean-up operation was conducted by the security institutions against militants of MQM. Mirza (1995) stated that the hostilities between the MQM and the establishment got serious at suspected extra-judicial killings of MQM members by the security forces (p.8). Ahmar (1996) has quoted Herald, 'since July 1995 to January 1996 as many as 70 police encounters have taken place in the city in which over 120 'terrorists' have been killed' (p.1035). At another place it is quoted that '11 encounters took place in January 1996 alone, resulting in the death of 23 MQM activists. The civil strife in Karachi has resulted in the killings of 2095 people in 1995 and 1113 in 1994' (p.1035).

7.3. Financial Transparency

The frequent violent clashes have badly impacted the infrastructure of the city (Karachi). The deteriorated law and order situation has halted economic progress as well. The Karachi Chamber of Commerce and Industry (KCCI) declared that single working day loss in Karachi due to strike costs of 1.3 billion rupees ($ 38 million), and in 1995 a total of 34 working days were wasted because of a strike announced by MQM. The loss of human lives and economic decay has labelled the economic hub of a state as 'the bleeding wound of Pakistan'. The United States has declared Karachi a danger zone after the killing of her two consulate members. The impression has been assumed by other countries as well by directing their citizens to stay away from Karachi. The grave law and order situation has put a question mark on the legitimacy of Benazir Bhutto's political government. PPP's administration could not perform well to control the violence and maintain peace. The other things that contributed to demoralising the party include the enforcement of the IMF (International Monetary Fund) austerity policy that contributed to boosting inflation in the society. The economic deteriorated situation has hit the labour class that was considered the support base of PPP. The budget of 1996 was unpopular due to high taxation and increasing inflation. The anti-budget protest was observed, and a few sectors and professions including transport, doctors, booksellers, and newspaper vendors threaten to go on strike (LaPorte, 1997).

7.4. Corruption

Both tenures of the PPP under Benazir Bhutto have been characterized by charges of corruption. The judiciary has accused Benazir Bhutto and her husband Asif Ali Zardari of receiving kickbacks in governmental contracts with a Swiss firm in 1994. The court verdict has clarified

the fact that the national exchequer had faced financial loss. Benazir Bhutto and Asif Ali Zardari were accused of stealing $100 million (The Guardian). But they consistently keep denying the accusations. The lack of financial transparency has contributed to the dismissal of Benazir Bhutto's regimes. The ranking of Pakistan has been observed at 109 in 1995 onthe corruption index (Transparency International). The corruption charges have polluted the image as well as the performance of PPP's leadership.

7.5. Institutional Collaboration

Institutional collaboration has remained at a minimum level during both regimes of Benazir Bhutto. The constant clashes with the opposition and differences with the security institutions have made the rule of PPP under Benazir Bhutto a 'roller coaster.'

Above mentioned all factors have negatively impacted the performance of PPP's government. The bad governance hampered the personality charisma of Benazir Bhutto and gave birth to a legitimacy crisis that ultimately paved the way for the dismissal of her rule.

8. Accountability

The concept and practice of accountability is an essential features of democracy that contribute toward good governance. Good governance increases the capacity of a political system that ultimately promotes the process of political development. The role of political institutions and mechanisms is essential to ensure transparency and accountability in the system. Lederman Et Al. (2005) stated, 'political mechanism that increases political accountability, either by encouraging punishment of corrupt individuals or by reducing the informational problem related to government activities, tend to reduce the incidence of corruption (p.2). The scale of accountability is determined by certain characteristics of a political system that includes;

1. 'The degree of competition in the political system,
2. The existence of check and balance mechanisms across different branches of government,
3. The transparency of the system' (Lederman Et Al., 2005, p.4).

The degree of competition depicts the civic culture of society. It denotes the power of the electorate to make the representatives accountable based on their performance in the election. While the presence of check and balance among governmental organs restricts the misuse of power by any institution (Rose-Ackerman, 1999). The transparency of the system is based on the decentralization of power and the freedom of expression (Giglioli, 1996).

In Pakistan, the legal efforts to ensure systematic accountability include the prevention of corruption act (1947), the Pakistan Penal code-1860 and the National Accountability Ordinance-1999 whereas the domain of accountability was ignored in actual practices.

The era of Benazir Bhutto in Pakistan has not depicted serious efforts regarding the promotion of accountability. The first institution was formulated in 1996 to counter corruption and ensure accountability in the system. The institution was named 'Ehtisaab Cell' (EC) and was established by the caretaker government of Malik Meraj Khalid. The same institution was allowed to work in the government of Nawaz Sharif in 1997 by approving the Ehtisaab Act 1997 in the assembly. The EC has turned into National Accountability Bureau (NAB) during the period of General Pervaiz Musharraf.

The period of Benazir Bhutto was the revival of democracy in Pakistan, but it was also characterized by continuous institutional clashes and politicization of state institutions. The politicization of state institutions means the working of administrative units aligned with the agenda of the political ruling elite. The judiciary has also contributed to the politicization of the political elite.

The Period of Benazir Bhutto was characterized by the misuse of state authority and support for party members and relatives unlawfully. She also received the same observations as her father of being authoritative and arbitrary use of power (Farzana, 2009, p.139). The appointment of Nusrat Bhutto (Her mother) and Hakim Ali Zardari (her father-in-law) as chairman of the public account committee and as a senior minister has proved the traits of nepotism and authoritarian style of administration. The stated features of her rule have played a role as hurdles in the way of transparency and accountability.

The ruling period of Benazir Bhutto was short as her first government was formulated in 1988 and dismissed after twenty-one months of her rule. However her second tenure consists of thirty-eight months that was also dismissed before the constitutional term of office. The unfinished or pre-mature terms of Benazir Bhutto could not get enough time to promote institutionalization in the state. The available time was consumed in countering clashes with the opposition instead of ensuring transparency and accountability.

9. Distribution of Power

The constitution of the state is the sacred document that distributes the powers among different designations as well as determines the relationship between the federal government and federating units. The fair distribution of power gave birth to a harmonious and respectful relationship between state institutions and designations. The fair distribution of power leads to a stable political system that works to meet popular demands. The presence of stability and smooth working of a political system ensures the process of political development in Pakistan.

The Federation of Pakistan has experienced long authoritative regimes and civilian populist rules. Constitutional history has depicted that the distribution of power between the two designations of the Prime Minister and the President remained as a musical chair.

9.1. Damages of the Eighth Constitutional Amendment

The constitution of Pakistan 1973 has devised a parliamentary form of government that enhance the powers of the Prime Minister. While the tilt of power shifted toward the President after the inclusion of the eighth amendment in the Constitution which enables the President to dissolve the government. The eighth constitutional amendment was introduced during the rule of General Zia-ul-Haq. Article 58 (2) (b) has provided the President with discretionary power to dissolve the elected government. Khan (2001) has added about the eighth constitutional amendment as instead of providing a solution, it served as the reason for political instability in Pakistan. The four elected governments had faced the consequences of unrestricted Presidential power and four governments were dismissed in a short span of eight years (p.863).

The period of Benazir Bhutto has experienced twice the damages of the eighth amendment being the victim of pre-mature dissolved governments. Both terms of Benazir Bhutto confronted the challenging relationship with the presidency. The lack of harmony and understanding had generated continuous tussle between the two mentioned offices that resulted in weak governmental performance.

Conclusion

The rule of the PPP under Benazir Bhutto has marked the revival of democracy in Pakistan after a long military period of General Zia-ul-Haq. It was started with the hope that state institutions would flourish instead of a personality-oriented political setup. But the clash between state institutions and designations dismissed the first term of Benazir Bhutto. The Second term denotes the following of her father's footprints. The personality traits were dominating the system. The efforts were initiated to promote good governance in the state, but the presence of nepotism and patron-client political culture had undermined the desired outcomes. Political

confrontation and deviation from the ideological foundation have made the government weak and unstable. The mentioned traits have not only damaged the democratic norms in the state but the structure and working of the party itself.

The two terms of Benazir Bhutto were not smooth and did not provide enough time for the government to implement its populist programs promised to the common people. Both terms of Benazir Bhutto were dismissed before time on the charges of corruption and misuse of power. The plethora of corruption charges has damaged her image as a ruler and political leader. She has to face criticism not from the outside only, but internal party rifts and fragmentations making the PPP weak inside. She sensed her level of political popularity and remained in exile for almost a decade. The process of political; development was halted due to personalization in the political setup. The observance of merit, transparency and strengthening of institutions can flourish the democratic norms in the state.

References

Abdullah, A. (1990). MushtarkaMufadat Ki Council Ki TashkeelKonKareGa?" *Zindagi,* 19-23.

Ahmar, M. (1996). Ethnicity and State Power in Pakistan: The Karachi Crisis. *Asian Survey, 36*(10), 1031-1048.

Amin, T. (1994). Pakistan in 1994: The Politics of Confrontation. *Asian Survey, 35*(2), 140-146

Amjad, R. (1978). *Pakistan's Growth Experience*. Lahore: Progressive Publishers.

Associates, M. (1994). Institutional Reforms to Accelerate Irrigated Agriculture (Vol. I & II). Washington, D.C.

Bank, D. o. t. W. (April,1978). Pakistan: Development Issues and Policies (South-Asia Region ed., Vol. I): World Bank.

Bank, W. (1994). Pakistan: A Strategy for Sustainable Agriculture Growth Agricultural Operations Division, South Asia Region.

Bhutto, Z. A. (April,1973). Pakistan Builds Anew. *Foreign Affairs, 51*(03).

Brownlee, J. (2007). Hereditary Succession in Modern Autocracies. *World Politics, 59*(4), 595-628.

Daniel Lederman, N. V. L. a. R. R. S. (2005). Accountability and Corruption: Political Institutions Matter *Economics and Politics 17*(1), 1-35.

F. Burns, J. (1989, 2-11-1989). Bhutto Survives as No-Confidence Vote Falls Short,*The New York Times*.

Gabriel A. Almond, S. V. (1963). *The Civic Culture: Political Attitudes and Democracy in Five Nations*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Galpin, R. (1999). Bhutto Found Guilty of Corruption, *The Guardian*.

Ghayur, S. (2009). *Evolution of the Industrial Relations System in Pakistan*. New York: Cornell University.

Gideon Rahat, T. S. (2007). The Personalization of Politics: Israel, 1949–2003. *Political Communication 24*(1), 65-80.

Giglioli, P. P. (1996). Political corruption and the media: the Tangentopoli affair. *International Social Science Journal, 48*(149), 381-394.

Hayat, M. W. a. S. (1997). Political Development and Conflict Resolution in Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review, 36*(4), 715-742.

Huntington, S. P. (1968). *Political Order in Changing Societies*. Yale University Press: New Haven.

Ibrahim, M. (2014). The Significance of Political Participation in Political Development: A Case Study of Pakistan. *Journal of Public Administration and Governance, 4*(4).

ICG. (2004). Pakistan: Reforming the Education Sector *Asia Report* Islamabad & Brussels: International Crisis Group.

Investors, M.-T. P. R. P. f. L. T. Pakistan GDP Growth Rate 1961-2021 Retrieved 12 December, 2020, from https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/PAK/pakistan/gdp-growth-rate

Islam, M. S. (2017). *Governance and Development*. United Kingdom: Springer Nature.

Jr, R. L. (1975). *Power and Privilege: Influence and Decision-Making in Pakistan*. Berkley: University of California Press.

Khan, H. (2001). *Constitutional and Political History of Pakistan.* Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

LaPorte, R. J. (1997). Pakistan in 1996: Starting Over Again. *Asian Survey, 37*(2), 118-125.

Lipset, S. M. (1960). *Political Man: The Social Basis of Politics*. New York: Doubleday.

Lodhi, M. (2011). *Pakistan: Beyond the Crisis State*. United Kingdom: Oxford University Press.

Maniruzzaman, T. (1967). National Integration and Political Development in Pakistan. *Asian Survey, 7*(12), 876-885

Michels, R. (1968). *Political Parties*. New York: The Free Press.

Mirza, M. (1995). The Question of Custodial Killings. *The Friday Times,* 19-25.

Niazi, Z. (2002). And Now for the Good News... *Index on Censorship, 31*(4).

Nizami, A. (December 2, 1989). A Balance Sheet in the Deficit,*The Nation*.

Pakistan, E. C. o. (1994). Report on General Elections 1993 (Vol. I, pp. 238-239.). Islamabad: ECP.

Pakistan, F. D. O. (1972). *The Decision of the Governors*. Islamabad: National Documentation Centre (NDC).

Pakistan, T. G. O. (1996). *Pakistan Telecommunication Act*. (Act No. XVII). Islamabad: Retrieved from http://www.pta.gov.pk.

Panhwar, S. (1972). *Marching Towards Democracy: A collection of articles, statements and speeches 1970-1971 by Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto*. Rawalpindi: Pakistan Publications.

Planning Commission, G. o. P. (1988). Seventh Five Year Plan, 1988-93 and Perspective Plan 1988-2003. Islamabad.

Rabea Malik, A. N. (2012). Financing Education in Pakistan: The Impact of Public Expenditure and Aid on Educational Outcomes *Research Consortium on Educational Outcomes and Poverty*. Cambridge: University of Cambridge.

Rais, R. B. (1989). Pakistan in 1988: From Command to Conciliation Politics. *Asian Survey, 29*(2), 199-206.

Rose-Ackerman, S. (1999). *Corruption and Government: Causes, Consequences, and Reform* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Sayed, K. B. (1980). *Politics in Pakistan: The Nature and Direction of Change*. New York: Praeger Publishers.

Scharpf, F. W. (1997). Economic integration, democracy, and the welfare state. *Journal of European Public Policy, 4*(1), 18-36.

Shafqat, S. (1996). Pakistan under Benazir Bhutto. *Asian Survey, 36*(7), 655-672.

Shaikh, F. (2009). *Making Sense of Pakistan*. New York: Colombia University Press.

Shakir, M. (1982). On National Integration. *Social Scientist, 10*(4), 36-45.

Weber, M. (2002). *Economy and society. Outline of Understanding Sociology*. Germany: Mohr Siebeck.

Weinbaum, M. G. (1996). Civic Culture and Democracy in Pakistan. *Asian Survey, 36* (7), 639-654

Weiss, A. M. (1990). Benazir Bhutto and the Future of Women in Pakistan. *Asian Survey, 30*(5), 433-445

Wynbrandt, J. (2009). *A Brief History of Pakistan*. New York: Infobase Publishing.

Younas, S. (1993). *SiyasiIttehadaur Pakistani Siyasat par unkeAsrat, 1947-1990 (Urdu)*. Lahore: Jang Publishers.

Yusuf, Z. (1989, 20 July). A Woman's Bank, *Dawn Overseas Weekly*.